



**Maryland Longitudinal Data System Governing Board
Special Meeting Minutes - February 1, 2023**

The meeting of the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Governing Board was held on February 1, 2023, via teleconference. Dr. Sylvia Lawson, acting on behalf of MLDS Governing Board Vice-Chair Mr. Choudhury, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and noted that a quorum was present.

The following Governing Board members were in attendance:

Dr. Sylvia Lawson, Deputy Superintendent for School Effectiveness, Maryland State Department of Education (Designee for Mr. Mohammed Choudhury, Superintendent)
Ms. Portia, Acting Secretary of Labor
Dr. Nancy Shapiro, Associate Vice-Chancellor for Education & Outreach, University System of Maryland (Designee for Dr. Jay Perman, Chancellor)
Mr. John Irvine, Director and Research and Evaluation, Department of Juvenile Services (Designee for Mr. Vincent Schiraldi, Acting Secretary)
Mr. Daniel Wait, Director of the Office of Human Resource Development and Training, Department of Human Services (Designee for Acting Secretary Rafael Lopez)
Dr. Angela Sherman, Vice President for Academic Affairs, Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association (Designee for Mr. Matthew Power, President)
Dr. Brad Phillips, Executive Director, Maryland Association of Community College
Dr. Phyllis Keys, Acting Interim Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs and Professor of Finance, Morgan State University (Designee for President Wilson)
Mr. Jason Dykstra, Executive Director, Instructional Data Division, Anne Arundel County Public Schools
Mr. Chris Biggs, Information Assurance Manager, Raytheon Company
Dr. Susan Sterett, Professor of Public Policy, University of Maryland, Baltimore County
Mr. Steven Rizzi, Vice President, PAR Government

The following MLDS Center staff were in attendance:

Mr. Ross Goldstein, Executive Director, MLDS Center
Dr. Angela Henneberger, Director of Research, MLDS Center and Research Assistant Professor, University of Maryland, School of Social Work
Dr. Ann Kellogg, Director of Reporting Services, MLDS Center, and MHEC Liaison
Ms. Molly Abend, Data Management Coordinator, MLDS Center, and MSDE Liaison
Mr. Alan Dunklow, Assistant Attorney General

Approval of the Meeting Minutes

Dr. Lawson asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the December 9, 2022 meeting. Dr. Sterett made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Dr. Sherman. The motion was unanimously approved.

Next, Dr. Lawson asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the January 14, 2023 special meeting. Dr. Shapiro made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Mr. Rizzi. The motion was unanimously approved.

External Research - New Application

Project Overview

Dr. Lawson asked Ms. Chandra Haislet, Assistant State Superintendent, Division of Assessment, Accountability, and Performance Reporting, to provide an overview of the project. Ms. Haislet began her overview by noting that this College and Career Readiness (CCR) study is a requirement of the *Blueprint for Maryland's Future*. MSDE is directed to contract with an external research organization to conduct an empirical study of the skills, knowledge, and abilities needed to succeed in the first year of Maryland community college coursework. There are two parts to the study: a quantitative component and a contents and alignment study. The quantitative component is the one that involves MLDS data. The study will measure the relationship between the interim CCR standard and student readiness to succeed in entry level credit-bearing coursework or postsecondary education training. The study will also explore additional possible measures of student readiness beyond the interim CCR standard. Based on previous research, possible measures could include GPA, course credit attainment, career and technical education course credit attainment, or a combination of these with assessment scores, attendance, or other behavioral metrics. Ms. Haislet provided an overview of the content and standards alignment study, noting that it will involve a deep content analysis to determine the levels and types of literacy in reading, writing, and mathematics that are needed to succeed in entry -level courses and postsecondary training offered at colleges in the state. Next, Ms. Haislet noted that there have been meetings with the MLDS Center's Research and Policy Advisory Board (RPB) and that other opportunities for engagement are being planned.

Next, Ms. Haislet provided an overview of the American Institutes for Research (AIR), which was selected and approved to conduct the studies. AIR is nationally recognized and experienced in these types of studies. Finally, Ms. Haislet provided an overview of the project timeline and noted that there is a September 23rd deadline to report the findings of the studies to the Accountability and Implementation Board.

Dr. Lawson reiterated that this report is a legislative mandate due September 2023. The report is an important component for ensuring student success.

Motion - Dr. Lawson asked for a motion to approve the CCR research application. Mr. Biggs made the motion to approve the research application.

Discussion

Dr. Shapiro noted her appreciation for the listening sessions and asked how the session will be announced and publicized. Ms. Haislet responded that MSDE plans to widely circulate an advertisement for the sessions. They will also make sure direct invitations are sent to key stakeholders several days in advance for the first meeting and will announce a schedule for future meetings.

In response to a question from Mr. Rizzi, Ms. Haislet explained that the use of the MLDS was not required by the contract. However, multi-sector data analysis was required, and the MLDS was the most expedient way to analyze multi-sector data.

Mr. Rizzi stated that his issue is about who should have access to the data, noting that the Board has been cautious about this due to privacy and concerns about intent and motivations of different actors. Mr. Rizzi stated that the Board was resistant to providing access to individuals not in the academic community and he worries about the precedent being established by granting access to a commercial entity. Mr. Goldstein responded that the *Policy on External Research and Grant Funded Projects*, which were reviewed and approved by the Board, limit external project applications to staff or faculty of qualifying institutions (defined as an institution that provides unit record data to MHEC) unless staff or faculty from a non-qualifying institution partner with staff or faculty from a qualifying institution to submit the application under the procedures. In this case, AIR has partnered with Dr. Tracy Sweet, Professor at UM College of Education and a member of the MLDS Center Research Branch.

Ms. Wu asked about the scope of the study and whether the impact of apprenticeships on CCR will be reviewed. Ms. Haislet responded that apprenticeship will be considered as one of the alternative measures.

Mr. Biggs noted his agreement with Mr. Rizzi to be cautious about providing data to a private company for research. However, in this case, the purpose is to fulfill a legislatively mandated requirement. Mr. Goldstein agreed that the purpose of the study is important, noting that a key part of the *Policy on External Research and Grant Funded Projects* is to ensure that all projects provide a benefit to the State. A project for a commercial purpose would not be permitted.

Dr. Shapiro asked what privacy and security protections are required of the researchers at AIR. Mr. Goldstein responded that MLDS data are not being handed over to AIR. All data are maintained by the Center and accessed by the researcher via a secure virtual machine. The researchers were required to complete the Center's extensive *Staff Authorization and Access Form*, which includes a Criminal History Background Investigation, FERPA training, cybersecurity training, completion of the Rules of Security Behavior and a non-disclosure agreement. All work is conducted on the virtual machine and nothing is removed from the MLDS until it has been reviewed by the executive director for compliance with suppression standards.

Dr. Phillips noted his appreciation for the pause in this review process that allowed time to listen to concerns and heighten the level of engagement.

Mr. Rizzi asked what role and what context the MLDS Research Branch will be involved in the study and will they review and validate the findings. Mr. Goldstein responded that they will be a resource to answer questions about the data and the system. However, this is an independent study and the Research Branch will not review the findings or offer an opinion on their validity. Finally, Mr. Rizzi asked whether the researchers will have access to any data that they want. Mr. Goldstein responded that they will have access to data within the confines of their research proposal, which lays out the broad sectors of data that they intend to use. If they need additional data beyond that scope, they will have to amend their proposal.

Dr. Shapiro asked whether the research plan will conform to recommendations to only look at first semester college outcomes and retention to a second semester. Ms. Haislet said that was her understanding. Dr. Lawson reiterated that the study will not change from its original scope. Dr. Shapiro stated that she wanted to state the study recommendations for the record. The second recommendation was to disaggregate results by the grade level when the student achieves college readiness (i.e. 10th, 11th, or 12th grades), noting that this will be an important insight for understanding CCR. The third recommendation is to take into consideration the fact that students do not go directly into college - especially now that Governor Moore is developing a gap year of service. Finally, Dr. Shapiro also suggested that the study consider student attendance, which is a predictor of student success in K-12 and may be a predictor for college as well.

Board Action - Dr. Shapiro seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken.

Member	Support	Oppose
Dr. Sylvia Lawson	✓	
Ms. Portia Wu	✓	
Mr. John Irvine	✓	
Dr. Phyllis Keys	✓	
Dr. Nancy Shapiro	✓	
Dr. Brad Phillips	✓	
Dr. Angela Sherman	✓	
Mr. Jason Dykstra	✓	
Dr. Susan Sterett	✓	
Mr. Steven Rizzi		✓
Mr. Christopher Biggs*	✓	
Mr. Daniel Wait	✓	

The motion was approved. Mr. Goldstein reminded the Board members that the next regularly scheduled meeting will be held virtually on March 10th at 9 a.m. to 12 p.m..

Respectfully submitted,
 Ross Goldstein
 Executive Director

Approved: March 10, 2023